

SOCIOLOGY 656 - Society, Power and the Environment

Fall Term 2013
Tuesday 5-8 pm, Tory 4-4
Department of Sociology, University of Alberta

Ken Caine, Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology
Office: 4-25 Tory
Office Hours: By appointment
Telephone: 492-5853
ken.caine@ualberta.ca

Course Description:

In this graduate seminar we will explore contemporary social theories on power from an environmental sociology perspective, primarily through empirical research. A cursory glance at the environmental studies literature suggests that much current examination of the environment tends to emphasize (ecological) modernization processes as part of the paradigm of sustainable development. In this seminar we will intellectually confront and challenge this perspective on the environment by delving into critical theory, political ecology/economy, and theories of social practice. Focus will be on how power is conceptualized and theorized in terms of the social-ecological environment but also how it is empirically studied when exploring issues of environmental governance, development, and natural resource management and exploitation. We will read, discuss and critique interpretations and application of select contemporary theories relating to environmental stewardship and governance, and natural resource use and management. Through discussion of texts surrounding issues of the historical development of common property resources, cultural landscapes and space, climate change, water use, food, wildlife, industrial resource development and environmental degradation, students will further develop their own writings pertaining to their research interests. Attendance at all seminars is mandatory.

Objectives:

1. To provide an equitable and intellectually supportive environment for students to explore and critique environmental sociology's contribution to environmental problems.
2. To become familiar with key sociological theories of power and how they might apply and contribute to natural resource and broader environmental issues.
3. To foster, through seminar discussion and writings, a critical approach to theoretical orientations to environmental issues.
4. To apply course readings, seminar discussions, and weekly writing to an environmental topic/issue in a research paper that is of publishable quality.

Note: Policy about course outlines can be found in §23.4(2) of the University Calendar

Grading:

Percent grades are based on holistic evaluations throughout the term. Total percent grades are cumulatively computed using a weighted calculation according to each of the below assignment descriptions. Final letter grades will be determined at the end of the term after all course requirements are fulfilled, and will be allocated according to the following grade contract.

Description	Percentage	Grade	Value
Excellent	90-100	A+	4.0
	86-89	A	4.0
	82-85	A-	3.7
Good	78-81	B+	3.3
	74-77	B	3.0
	70-73	B-	2.7
Satisfactory	66-69	C+	2.3
	62-65	C	2.0
	58-61	C-	1.7
Poor	54-57	D+	1.3
Minimal Pass	50-53	D	1.0
Fail	0-49	F	0.0

CLASS PARTICIPATION (15%)

The success of seminar-style classes is dependent upon the quality of in-class discussion. Each student is expected to have read all the required readings assigned for each week, formulate at least two discussion topics/questions to share, and be prepared to participate in discussion.

CRITICAL RESPONSE PAPERS - 5 throughout the term; your choice of weeks (25%)

For the weeks that you select: *by no later than 10 pm each Sunday* prior to the seminar, students will provide me (by email) with a one-page (single spaced) response to that week’s required readings. I will then post these on the eClass site for student reading prior to the seminar. This is not meant to be a descriptive summary of the readings but rather a critical and creative response to the readings (i.e. to theory, concepts, arguments, etc.). Your critical response paper should include:

- one block of text that you interrogate and,
- 1-2 questions that arise from your detailed reading and critique,

all of which should stimulate thought and discussion in the seminar. You may also wish to relate the readings to your research interests and/or personal experiences in environmental studies.

Please note that you cannot provide a critical response for the same week in which you present your seminar.

ONE SEMINAR LEAD (20%)

A seminar schedule for the term will be developed with students in the first class. In your presentation and facilitation of the readings your role will be to extend and deepen discussion of how power filters through and is actualized in social-environmental practices. Along with presenting the key concepts and arguments of the papers, you should critically engage with the larger social, political, cultural and economic issues presented in and between the readings and pose substantive questions for discussion. Your objective is to open up and facilitate class discussion on difficult and perplexing issues, so prepare your seminar in a way that allows others in the class to participate. You might want to provide a short (i.e. one page) outline of your key points, interesting problematics/issues that arise in your reading, and questions to the class. Note: you are responsible

for reading all required articles each week.

Student seminar leads will be graded based on a holistic scheme, but will take into account the following: the relevance of your presentation to the themes and theories of that topic; the effectiveness of your seminar in initiating and facilitating discussion; your preparedness in leading the seminar discussion; how accurately, comprehensively and insightfully you covered the readings and any necessary background research; how well you lead seminar discussion by elaborating on concepts and ideas from related critical response papers and previous class discussion; and finally how clear and coherent the presentation was towards achieving its objectives.

RESEARCH PAPER (40%) – Proposal due October 15th; Final Paper due December 3rd

Each student is required to prepare a 20-25 page (double spaced) paper according to your interests relating to environmental / natural resource issues and forms of social-political power. This can be part of your dissertation/thesis proposal, as an essay interrogating a cluster of themes from the course readings, or a research paper relating to one of the course themes. These options will be discussed further in class. A 2-3 page proposal (double spaced, with a minimum of 10 references) must be submitted to me by October 15th. A paper copy of your term paper is due on Monday, December 3rd to the Sociology Main Office with an electronic version emailed to me on that same day. I strongly urge you to make an appointment with me early in the term to discuss your interests and ideas for the paper.

Late term papers will be penalized. Late proposals will not be accepted. For the Research Paper students will be eligible for a three-day extension provided you request this from me at least one day in advance of the due date. After the grace period, your grade will be marked down 10% per late day at my discretion. If you are ill and are unable to complete your work by the due date, you must contact me immediately, preferably within 3 days after the due date.

Final grades will be consistent with GFC graduate marking guidelines. The following conditions apply for students requesting that their course work be re-evaluated: first, you must present an argument explaining why your work should be re-evaluated and, second, you must make your request for re-evaluation within one week of having your grade posted.

Seminar Ground Rules

Seminars allow exploration and open discussion of issues and topics that may well present a problem for some students. It is important during discussions that students keep an open mind, take into account one another's perspectives, and, if necessary, 'agree to disagree'. All seminar participants must have courtesy and consideration for others in exchanges, however contentious and heated they may become. If I feel that these expectations have been violated the student(s) involved will be asked to leave the class.

Recording of Lectures

Audio or video recording of lectures, labs, seminars or any other teaching environment by students is allowed only with the prior written consent of the instructor or as a part of an approved accommodation plan. Recorded material is to be used solely for personal study, and is not to be used or distributed for any other purpose without prior written consent from the instructor.

Students with Disabilities or Special Needs:

Students who require accommodations in this course due to a disability affecting mobility, vision, hearing, learning, or mental or physical health are advised to discuss their needs with Specialized Support and Disability Services (SSDS), 2-800 SUB, 780-492-3381. Please contact me within the first

two weeks of class in order to inform me of any special accommodations recommended by SSDS for your participation in the seminar. Students registered with SSDS who will be using accommodations in the classroom, or who will be writing exams through SSDS, are required to provide a “Letter of Introduction” within the first two weeks of class.

University Policy on Academic Misconduct:

The University of Alberta is committed to the highest standards of academic integrity and honesty. Students are expected to be familiar with these standards regarding academic honesty and to uphold the policies of the University in this respect. Students are particularly urged to familiarize themselves with the provisions of the Code of Student Behaviour (online at www.governance.ualberta.ca) and avoid any behaviour which could potentially result in suspicions of cheating, plagiarism, misrepresentation of facts and/or participation in an offence. Academic dishonesty is a serious offence and can result in suspension or expulsion from the University. Please familiarize yourself with the “Don’t Cheat” sheet at: <http://www.governance.ualberta.ca/StudentAppeals/DontCheatsheet.aspx>. The U of A considers plagiarism, cheating, misrepresentation of facts and participation in an offence to be serious academic offences. Plagiarism, cheating, misrepresentation of facts and participation in an offence can be avoided if students are told what these offences are and if possible sanctions are made clear at the outset. Instructors should understand that the principles embodied in the Code are essential to our academic purpose. For this reason, instructors will be fully supported by Departments, Faculties and the University in their endeavours to rightfully discover and pursue cases of academic dishonesty in accordance with the Code.

Course Outline

**Additional readings may be added/removed; and the weekly seminar list may be modified. Readings under “Required” are just that – you are required to read these for each week’s seminar; those under “Further Readings” are additional and optional – you may want to skim them or take note for use in your research paper.

Note on sources:

(E) – available online through UA library

(M) – available from Moodle site

(UA) – purchase from UA Bookstore)

Please Note: Because we are meeting nearly a week after the formal start of classes and our seminar is three hours, our first meeting will be an introduction to the course, followed by a full seminar. Please be prepared to contribute to a discussion (however surficial at this point in the term) of the readings.

September 10 – Introductions, Course Overview & Seminar on Theories of Power and the Environment

Required:

Barnes, Barry. 1993. “Power”. Pp. 197-219 in R. Bellamy (Ed.) *Theories and Concepts of Politics: An Introduction*. Manchester University Press: Manchester and New York. (M)

Haugaard, Mark. 2010. “Power: A ‘family resemblance’ concept.” *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 13: 419-438. (E)

Hayward, Clarissa and Steven Lukes. 2008. “Nobody to shoot? Power, structure, and agency: A dialogue.” *Journal of Power*, 1(1): 5-20 (E)

Ribot, J.C. and N.L. Peluso. 2003. “A Theory of Access.” *Rural Sociology* 68(2): 153-181. (E)

McMichael, Philip. 2009. “Contemporary contradictions of the global development project: Geopolitics, global ecology, and the ‘development climate’.” *Third World Quarterly*, 30(1): 247-262. (E)

Further readings:

Haugaard, Mark. 2003. “Reflections on Seven Ways of Creating Power.” *European Journal of Social Theory*, 6(1): 87-113. (E)

Manual-Navarrete, David. 2010. “Power, Realism, and the Ideal of Human Emancipation in a Climate of Change.” *WIREs Climate Change*, 1(November/December): 781-785. (E)

September 17 – Dimensions of Power

Required:

Lukes, Steven. 2005. “Power, Freedom and Reason” **and** “Three Dimensional Power.” Pp. 60-151 in *Power: A Radical View* (Second Edition). New York: Palgrave. (M)

Caine, Ken J. and Naomi Krogman. 2010. “Powerful or Just Plain Power-Full? A Power Analysis of Impact and Benefit Agreements in Canada’s North.” *Organization and Environment*, 23(1): 76-98. (E)

McCright, Aaron M. and Riley E. Dunlap. 2010. "Anti-Reflexivity: The American Conservative Movement's Success in Undermining Climate Science and Policy." *Theory, Culture and Society*, 27(2-3): 100-133. (E)

Nie, Martin. 2003. "Drivers of natural resource based political conflict." *Policy Sciences* 36: 307-341. (E)

Further readings:

Mosse, David. 2010. A Relational Approach to Durable Poverty, Inequality and Power. *Journal of Development Studies*, 46(7), 1156-1178. (E)

September 24 – Extended Case Study – Book: Power and Powerlessness I

Required:

Gaventa, John. 1982. *Power and Powerlessness: Quiescence and Rebellion in an Appalachian Valley*. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press. (UA) Part 1 & 2 (Pp 1-121)

In class viewing of documentary: *Dam/Age* (2003)

October 1 – Extended Case Study – Book: Power and Powerlessness II

Required:

Gaventa, John. 1982. *Power and Powerlessness: Quiescence and Rebellion in an Appalachian Valley*. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press. (UA) Part 3 & 4 (Pp. 125-261)

In class viewing of documentary: *Harlan County, USA* (1976)

October 8 – Diversions and Alienation

Required:

Dickens, Peter. 2002. "A Green Marxism? Labor Processes, Alienation, and the Division of Labor". Pp. 51-72 in R. Dunlap, F.H. Buttel, P. Dickens, and A. Gijswijt (Eds), *Sociological Theory and the Environment: Classical Foundations, Contemporary Insights*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield. (M)

Foster, John Bellamy. 1999. "Marx's theory of metabolic rift: Classical foundations for environmental sociology." *American Journal of Sociology*, 105(2), 366-405. (E)

Freudenburg, William R. 2005. "Privileged Access, Privileged Accounts: Toward a Socially Structured Theory of Resources and Discourses." *Social Forces*, 84(1): 89-114. (E)

Salleh, Ariel. 1995. "Nature, Woman, Labor, Capital: Living the Deepest Contradiction." *Capitalism Nature Socialism*, 6(1): 21-39. (E)

Gaard, Greta. 2001. "Women, Water, Energy: An Ecofeminist Approach." *Organization and Environment*, 14: 157-172. DOI: 10.1177/1086026601142002 (E).

Further readings:

Salleh, Ariel. 2010. "From Metabolic Rift to Metabolic Value: Reflections on Environmental Sociology and the Alternative Globalization Movement." *Organization & Environment*, 23(2): 205-219. (E)

Levien, Michael. 2012. "The land question: special economic zones and the political economy of dispossession in India." *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, 39(3-4), 933-969. DOI:10.1080/03066150.2012.656268 (E)

October 15 – Treadmills & World Systems: Realist Perspectives on Power and the Environment (*Research Paper Proposal Due*)

Required:

Gould, Kenneth A., David N. Pellow and Allan Schnaiberg. 2004. "Interrogating the Treadmill of Production: Everything You Wanted to Know about the Treadmill but Were Afraid To Ask." *Organization and Environment*, 17: 296-316. (E)

Foster, John Bellamy. 2005. "The Treadmill of Accumulation: Schnaiberg's Environment and Marxian Political Economy." *Organization and Environment*, 18: 7-18. (E)

Mol, Arthur P.J. and Gert Spaargaren. 2000. "Ecological Modernisation theory in debate: A review." *Environmental Politics*, 9(1): 17-49. (E)

Davidson, Debra J. and Norah MacKendrick. 2004 "All Dressed up with Nowhere to Go: The Discourse of Ecological Modernization in Alberta." *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology* 41(1):47-65. (E)

Swyngedouw, Eric. 2006. "Water, Money, and Power." Pp. 195-212 in eds. Panitch L. and C. Leys. *Coming to Terms with Nature, Socialist Register 2007*. Merlin Press, London and Monthly Review Press, New York. (E)

Further readings:

Hornborg, Alf. 2009. "Zero-Sum World: Challenges in Conceptualizing Environmental Load Displacement and Ecologically Unequal Exchange in the World-System." *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*, 50(3-4): 237-262.

Dave Toke and Peter A. Strachan. 2006. "Ecological Modernization and Wind Power in the UK." *European Environment*, 16: 155-166.

Ventriss, Curtis, and Walter Kuentzel. 2005. "Critical Theory and the Role of Citizen Involvement in Environmental Decision Making: A Re-Examination." *International Journal of Organization Theory and Behavior*, 8(4): 519-539. (E)

October 22 – Symbolic Power in Practice

Required:

Swartz, David. 2013. "For a Sociology of Symbolic Power". Pp. 79-122 in *Symbolic Power, Politics, and Intellectuals: The Political Sociology of Pierre Bourdieu*. University of Chicago Press, Chicago. (M)

- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1990[1980]. "Structures, Habitus, Practices" (Pp. 52-65) and "Modes of Domination" (Pp. 122-134) in *The Logic of Practice*. Stanford: Stanford University Press. (M)
- Xiaojun, Zhang. 2004. "Land Reform in Yang Village: Symbolic Capital and the Determination of Class Status." *Modern China*, 30(1): 3-45. (E)
- Mosse, David. 1997. "The Symbolic Making of a Common Property Resource: History, Ecology and Locality in a Tank-irrigated Landscape in South India." *Development and Change*, 28: 467-504. (E)
- Nayak, Nalini. 2009. "Development for Some is Violence for Others: India's Fisherfolk." Pp. 109-120 in A. Salleh (ed.), *Eco-Sufficiency & Global Justice: Women Write Political Ecology*. Melbourne: Spinifex Press. (M)

Further Readings:

- Ballet, Jerome, Nicolas Sirven, and Melanie Requieres-Desjardins. 2007. "Social Capital and Natural Resource Management: A Critical Perspective." *Journal of Environment and Development*, 16(4): 355-374. (E)
- Haugaard, Mark. 2008. "Power and Habitus." *Journal of Power*, 1(2): 189-206. (E)

October 29 – Making Environment: Discourse

Required:

- Davidson, Debra and Mike Gismondi. 2011. *Challenging Legitimacy at the Precipice of Energy Calamity*. Springer. Chapters 1 (skim), 2 (discourse - read) and 7 (dominant ideologies - read). (E, M)
- Clare, Shari, Naomi Krogman, and Ken J. Caine. 2013. "The 'balance discourse': A case study of power and wetland management." *Geoforum*, 49: 40-49.
- Parkins, John. 2002. "Forest Management and Advisory Groups in Alberta: An Empirical Critique of an Emergent Public Sphere." *The Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 27(2): 163-184. (E)
- Bridge, Gavin. 2001. "Resource triumphalism: postindustrial narratives or primary commodity production." *Environment and Planning*, 33: 2149-2173. (E)

Further Readings:

- McMichael, Philip. 2000. "The power of food." *Agriculture and Human Values*, 17: 21-33.
- Peluso, Nancy Lee. 2009. "Rubber Erasures, Rubber Producing Rights: Making Racialized Territories in West Kalimantan, Indonesia." Pp. 46-78 in T. Sikor and C. Lund (Eds), *The Politics of Possession: Property, Authority, and Access to Natural Resources*. Malden, Mass: Wiley-Blackwell. (M)
- Mehta, Lyla. 1997. *Water, Difference And Power: Kutch And The Sardar Sarovar (Narmada) Project*. IDS Working Paper 54. 31pp.

Hannigan, John. 2006. "Discourse, Power Relations and Political Ecology." Pp. 53-62 in *Environmental Sociology*. New York: Routledge. (M)

Li, Tania Murray. 2004. "Environment, Indigeneity, and Transnationalism." Pp. 339-370 in R. Peets and M. Watts (Eds), *Liberation Ecologies: Environment, Development and Social Movements*. London: Routledge. (M)

Gismondi, Michael, and Mary Richardson. 1994. "Discourse and Power in Environmental Politics: Public Hearings on a Bleached Kraft Pulp Mill in Alberta, Canada." Pp. 232-252 in M. O'Connor (Ed.), *Is Capitalism Sustainable? Political Economy and the Politics of Ecology*. New York: Guilford Press. (M)

Campbell, Craig. 2004. "A Genealogy of the Concept of 'Wanton Slaughter' in Canadian Wildlife Biology." Pp. 155-171 in D.G. Anderson and M. Nuttall (Eds), *Cultivating Arctic landscapes: Knowing and Managing Animals in the Circumpolar North*. New York: Berghahn. (M)

November 5 – Governmentality

Required:

Foucault, Michel. 1982. "The Subject and Power" *Critical Inquiry*, 8(4): 777-795.

Darier, Eric. 1999. "Foucault and the Environment: An Introduction." Pp. 1-33 in E. Darier (Ed.), *Discourses of the Environment*. Oxford: Blackwell. (M)

Li, Tania. 2003. "Situating Resource Struggles: Concepts for Empirical Analysis." *Economic and Political Weekly*, 38(48): 5120-5128. (E)

Ekers, Michael, and Alex Loftus. 2008. "The Power of Water: Developing Dialogues between Foucault and Gramsci." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, 26: 698-718. (E)

Nadasdy, Paul. 1999. "The Politics of TEK: Power and the 'Integration' of Knowledge." *Arctic Anthropology*, 36(1-2): 1-18. (E)

Further Readings:

Malette, Sebastien. 2009. "Foucault for the Next Century: Eco-Governmentality." Pp. 221-237 in S. Binkley and J. Capetillo (Eds) *A Foucault for the 21st Century: Governmentality, Bio-Politics, and Discipline in the New Millennium*. Newcastle-Upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. (M)

Ekers Michael, Alex Loftus, and Geoff Mann. 2008. "Gramsci Lives!" *Geoforum*, (40): 287-291. (E)

November 12 – No Class / Fall Break

November 19 - Environmentality

Required:

Rossi, Benedatta. 2004. "Revisiting Foucauldian Approaches: Power Dynamics in Development Projects." *Journal of Development Studies*, 40(6): 1-29. (E)

Luke, Timothy W. 1995. "On Environmentality: Geo-Power and Eco-Knowledge in the Discourses of Contemporary Environmentalism." *Cultural Critique*, 31, The Politics of Systems and Environments, Part II (Autumn): 57-81.

Agrawal, Arun. 2005. "Environmentality." *Current Anthropology*, 46(2): 161-190. (E)

Cepek, Michael L. 2011. "Foucault in the Forest: Questioning Environmentality in Amazonia." *American Ethnologist*, 38(3): 501-515. (E)

Fletcher, Robert. 2010. "Neoliberal Environmentality: Towards a Poststructuralist Political Ecology of the Conservation Debate." *Conservation and Society*, 8(3): 171-181. (E)

Further Readings:

Luke, Timothy. W. 1999. "Environmentality as Green Governmentality." Pp. 121-151 in E. Darier (Ed.), *Discourses of the Environment*. Oxford: Blackwell. (M)

November 26 – The Construction of Governance: The World Bank, States, and Communities Required:

Foster, Emma. 2011. "Sustainable Development: Problematizing Normative Constructions of Gender within Global Environmental Governmentality." *Globalizations*, 8(2): 135-149. (E)

Richardson, Tim and Matthew Cashmore. 2011. "Power, knowledge and environmental assessment: the World Bank's pursuit of 'good governance'." *Journal of Political Power*, 4(1): 105-125. (E)

Goldman, Michael. 2001. "Constructing an Environmental State: Eco-governmentality and other Transnational Practices of a 'Green' World Bank." *Social Problems*, 48(4): 499-523. (E)

Oels, Angela. 2005. "Rendering climate change governable: From biopower to advanced liberal government?" *Journal of Environmental Policy & Planning*, 7(3): 185-207. (E)

Philip McMichael. 2012. "The land grab and corporate food regime restructuring" *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, 39(3-4): 681-701. DOI: 10.1080/03066150.2012.661369

Further Readings:

Li, Tania Murray, 2010. "Indigeneity, Capitalism, and the Management of Dispossession." *Current Anthropology*, 51(3): 385-414. (E)

Asher, Kiran, and Diana Ojeba. 2009. "Producing Nature and Making the State: Ordenamiento Territorial in the Pacific Lowlands of Columbia." *Geoforum*, 40: 292-302. (E)

Ferguson, James with Larry Lohmann. 1994. "The Anti-Politics Machine: "Development" and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho." *The Ecologist*, 24(5): 176-181. (E)

December 3 – Community, Collectivity and Agency (Research Paper Due**)**Required:

Wittman, Hannah. 2009. “Reworking the metabolic rift: La Vía Campesina, agrarian citizenship, and food sovereignty”, *Journal of Peasant Studies*, 36: 4, 805-826

Phadke, Roopali. 2011. “Reclaiming the Technological Imagination: Water, Power, and Place in India”. Pp. 244-262 in *Knowing Nature: Conversations at the Intersection of Political Ecology and Science Studies*. Ed. Mara J. Goldman, Paul Nadasdy, and Matthew D. Turner. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press. (M)

Takeda, Louise, and Inge Ropke. 2010. “Power and Contestation in Collaborative Ecosystem Based Management: The Case of Haida Gwaii.” *Ecological Economics*, 70: 178-188. (E)

Richardson, Tim. 2005. “Environmental assessment and planning theory: four short stories about power, multiple rationality, and ethics”. *Environmental Impact Assessment Review*, 25: 341–365. (E)

Goodman, David and E. Melanie DuPuis. 2002. “Knowing Food and Growing Food: Beyond the Production-Consumption Debate in the Sociology of Agriculture”. *Sociologia Ruralis*, 42(1): 5-22.

Further Readings:

Cleaver, Frances. 2012. “Continuity and Change: Gendered Agency and Bricolage”. Pp. 112-142 in *Development Through Bricolage: Rethinking Institutions for Natural Resource Management*. Routledge: London and New York. (M)

Poteete, Amy, and Jesse Ribot. 2010. “Repertoires of Domination: Decentralization as Process in Botswana and Senegal.” *World Development*, 39(3): 439-449. (E)

Cleaver, Frances. 2007. “Understanding Agency in Collective Action.” *Journal of Human Development and Collective Capabilities*, 8(2): 223-244. (E)

Leach, Melissa, Robin Mearns, and Ian Scoones. 1999. “Environmental Entitlements: Dynamics and Institutions in Community Based Natural Resource Management.” *World Development*, 27(2): 225-247. (E)

Wittman, Hannah. 2009. “Reframing agrarian citizenship: Land, life and power in Brazil.” *Journal of Rural Studies*, 25:120-130. (E)